# SELF-CONFRONTATION: A GATEWAY TOWARDS THE UNDERSTANDING OF ENGLISH TEACHERS' PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICE

# AUTOCONFRONTACIÓN: UNA APERTURA A LA COMPRENSIÓN DE LAS PRÁCTICAS PEDAGÓGICAS DE LOS MAESTROS DE INGLÉS

# AUTOCONFRONTAÇÃO: UMA ABERTURA PARA A COMPREENSÃO DAS PRÁTICAS PEDAGÓGICAS DE PROFESSORES DE INGLÊS

**María Fernanda Téllez Téllez[1] ***

1       maria.tellez@uexternado.edu.co  *Magíster en Educación con énfasis en Desarrollo Humano y Valores de la Universidad Externado de Colombia. Es licenciada en lenguas modernas de la Universidad de los Andes. Actualmente cursa sus estudios de Doctorado en Ciencias de la Educación en la Universidad Pedagógica y Tecnológica de Colombia en Tunja. Docente titular de la Facultad de Ciencias de la Educación de la Universidad Externado de Colombia email:* maria.tellez@uexternado.edu.co *Universidad Externado de Colombia, Bogotá, Colombia. https://orcid. org/0000-0002-9010-1862*

## ABSTRACT

This reflection article shows preliminary advances of a hermeneutic phenomenological research study which followed the instrumental case study methodology within a qualitative approach. The participants were four in-service English teachers from three public schools, and

one concession school in Bogotá, Colombia. Nevertheless, this article only includes data obtained from one of the participants (M1). The purpose of the current study was to unveil what knowledges emerged from the reflection on action of the participants' practices through self-confrontation. Data gathering instruments included a semi-structured and a focus group interviews, self-confrontation video recording transcripts and field notes. The thematic analysis was used to interpret data. The initial findings from M1 evinced that she reflected on her practices by relying on her empirical, experiential, and reflective knowledge.

## KEYWORDS:

reflection on action, self-confrontation, teachers' knowledge, pedagogical practices

## RESUMEN

Este artículo de reflexión muestra los avances preliminares de una investigación fenomenológica hermenéutica. Este artigo apresenta um estudo de caso instrumental com abordagem qualitativa. Los participantes fueron cuatro docentes de inglés en servicio, de tres colegios públicos y uno de concesión en Bogotá, Colombia. Sin embargo, el artículo solo incluye datos obtenidos de uno de los participantes (M1). El propósito del estudio fue develar qué conocimientos surgieron de la reflexión sobre la acción de las prácticas de los participantes a través de la autoconfrontación. Los instrumentos para la recolección de datos incluyeron una entrevista semiestructurada, un grupo focal, las trascripciones de video de las entrevistas de autoconfrontaciones y notas de campo. Se utilizó el análisis temático para interpretar los datos. Los hallazgos iniciales demostraron que M1 reflexionó sobre sus prácticas apoyándose en sus saberes empírico, experiencial y reflexivo.

## PALABRAS CLAVE:

 reflexión sobre la acción, autoconfrontación, saber de los docentes, prácticas pedagógicas

## RESUMO

Este artigo de reflexão mostra os avanços preliminares de uma investigação fenomenológica hermenêutica. Seguiu-se a metodologia do estudo de caso instrumental com abordagem qualitativa. O objetivo foi descrever e interpretar saberes emergentes da reflexão de quatro professores de inglês ao redor de suas próprias práticas em três escolas públicas e uma conveniada em Bogotá, Colômbia, por meio do autoconfronto. No entanto, o artigo inclui apenas dados obtidos de um dos participantes (M1). Os instrumentos de coleta de dados incluíram entrevista semiestruturada, grupo focal, transcrições em vídeo das entrevistas de autoconfrontação e notas de campo. A interpretação dos dados contou com o apoio da análise temática. As descobertas iniciais evidenciam que M1 refletiu sobre suas práticas a partir de seus conhecimentos empíricos, experienciais e reflexivos.

**PALAVRAS-CHAVE**: reflexão sobre a ação, autoconfrontação, saberes dos professores, práticas pedagógicas

## INTRODUCTION

This reflection article presents the preliminary findings from one of the participants of the ongoing research study entitled *Las prácticas pedagógicas de los maestros de inglés de la educación básica y media: La reflexión sobre la acción para la transformación*[2] (Pedagogical

practices from primary and high school English teachers: Reflection on action towards transformation). This study emerged from my experience as a teacher-researcher guiding in-service English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers in their postgraduate studies for more than one decade in a private university. Thanks to a teaching professional development seminar that I hosted, I observed that teachers were not used to reflect on their practices. The outcomes of a preliminary survey conducted to some of those teachers showed that teachers were not used to reflecting, registering reflections, or analyzing daily classroom practices. Under those circumstances, no record of classroom practice analysis was held.

In addition, I realized that investigations conducted in in-service EFL teachers' knowledge were still areas to be explored in Colombia. Teachers' knowledge has been studied for some decades and scholars have developed several frameworks to address such an important topic in several countries. Nevertheless, few scholars have undertaken research about local pre- and in-service EFL teachers' knowledge in Colombia. To comprehend pedagogical practices of pre- and in-service teachers, it is necessary for education programs to take account of theoretical foundation to understand teachers' knowledge. Fandiño (2013) highlights that teacher education programs in the country need to prepare English Language Teachers (ELT) to improve, know, and question what they do regarding their practice. Macías (2013) considers that some Colombian EFL teachers (novice and teacher educators in a public university in Colombia) support their practices on their pedagogical knowledge. This knowledge was nurtured not only by their methods and skills applied to teach the language, but also by their experience, reflection, and professional studies. This is also called "pedagogical content knowledge" (Fernández, 2014, p. 80). Álvarez (2009) mentions this construction of knowledge and calls it "teachers' knowledge base" (p. 73).

He states that it is a continuum that engages experiences of their personal and professional endeavors, which are permeated by key people in their life.

Additionally, Gómez (2020) conducted a study related to pedagogical content knowledge, with in-service EFL teachers doing their master's degree in Education in a private university and implementing their action research study, shows that participants nurture this knowledge and the knowledge about their students when being involved in each of the stages of their research practice.

Based on the facts and theory abovementioned, the research question on the study was the following: What knowledges are unveiled from the reflection on action of four in-service EFL teachers' pedagogical practices through a self-confrontation method (simple and crossed)? The objectives were: to describe in-service teachers' pedagogical knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge, and content knowledge of the field of study through self-confrontation method (simple and crossed); to comprehend English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers' lived experiences through self-confrontation; and to develop some principles for in-service teachers to foster the reflection of pedagogical practices through self-confrontation. I conducted this study with four in-service EFL teachers who work in primary or high school, in three public institutions, and one concession school.

**THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

The theoretical framework relies on five core pillars: Two decisive events in Colombian education, the influence of National Bilingual Program on EFL pedagogical practices, the relevance of reflection on teachers' actions; self-confrontation (simple and crossed), and knowledges of teachers.

## TWO DECISIVE EVENTS IN COLOMBIAN EDUCATION

There were two significant events (a research group and a movement) in the history of pedagogical practices that transformed education in the late 70s and the beginning of 80s. Those events provided the foundations for the study of teachers' knowledge and their practices. The research group was consolidated in 1978 (Ríos, 2018) and was entitled *Grupo de Historia de la Práctica Pedagógica en Colombia* (Group on the History of Pedagogical Practice in Colombia). The group deepened the study of teaching practices in different areas of knowledge (González & Tibaduiza, 2015) under the coordination of Olga Lucía Zuluaga, who began the gathering of pedagogical practices history in the country (Cárdenas & Boada, 2012; González & Tibaduiza, 2015). The group consisted of well-known public universities and researchers' participation and its findings nourished the pedagogical knowledge and the history of practices in the country (Zuluaga, as cited in Martínez, 2019; Ríos, 2018).

During the 80s, there was a movement advocating changes in Education: *Movimiento Pedagógico* (Pedagogical Movement) (Tamayo, 2006; Cárdenas & Boada, 2012). It claimed teachers' role as social actors (González & Tibaduiza, 2015; Cardona, 2005; Cárdenas & Boada, 2012), and influenced their teaching practice and their knowledge (Cárdenas & Boada, 2012). One of its tenets was to oppose the power relationships existing in Colombia related to the government and changes in education and teachers' practice (Peñuela & Rodríguez, 2006). Thus, these two relevant historical events contributed significantly to the understanding of EFL teachers, knowledge, and pedagogical practices.

## THE NATIONAL BILINGUAL PROGRAM AND SOME OF ITS CONSTRAINTS ON EFL PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICES

After the end of second world war and the gaining of power of the United States over South American countries, Colombia's linguistic policies have committed to a leading modality – bilingual education (Spanish and English) – to promote bilingual citizens. For almost two decades the government has implemented programs like the *Programa Nacional de Bilingüismo* (National Bilingual Program) 2004-2019 to reach its goal. The Ministry of National Education, *Ministerio de Educación Nacional* (MEN for its acronym in Spanish) has also launched other programs such as *Colombia Very Well! Programa Nacional de Inglés* (English National Program). This program was designed to be achieved by 2025. Finally, there is a current program running called *Colombia Bilingüe* (Bilingual Colombia) (Bonilla & Tejada, 2016). Along with these programs, the MEN implemented the *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment* (CERFL) (Council of Europe, 2001) as its leading landmark for all language programs. However, the CERFL was conceived for European countries whose economic and sociocultural circumstances were far different and incoherent to local realities in Colombia (M.M. Gómez, 2017). Likewise, English is not a nationwide language and the framework's practices are limiting and need to be contextualized (M.L. Cárdenas, 2006).

The abovementioned programs have provoked had high expectations on students' learning of English at public schools, but the reality has been complex. Indeed, the number of English classes proposed in the schools' curricula and the number of students per group do not allow for students' interaction to communicate in the foreign language (M. L. Cárdenas, 2006; A. C. Sánchez & Obando, 2008). Besides, teachers' proficiency in English remains low (Sánchez-

Jabba, 2013) despite all the efforts made by the MEN (2016) to instruct them.

Furthermore, Núñez-Pardo (2020a) attests, "It is the duty of teachers … to … develop materials, learning strategies, and methodologies that emerge from their particular settings, including contents that account for their voices, life experiences, and community problems" (p. 120). Although the MEN (2016) made textbooks such as *English Please! Fast Track* (MEN, 2020), methodologies proposed still promote foreign ones (Núñez-Pardo, 2020b). Thus, reflection on EFL practices needs to be adopted as a recurrent exercise to allow for teachers' self-appraisal of actions (Núñez et al., 2006). In sum, there is a quest for favoring the local context rather than a decontextualized one, for contemplating the use of contextualized methodologies and creation of own materials and for reflecting on EFL teachers' pedagogical practices under the National Bilingual Program to undertake transformations.

## THE RELEVANCE OF REFLECTION ON TEACHERS' ACTIONS

Reflection implies being focused on what we do and how we do it to make decisions to change. Dewey's (2004) definition of reflection encompasses understanding our own actions. Additionally, Korthagen and Vasalos (2005) underscore the capacity to engage themselves in thinking about their actions. Thence, people reflect on their learning by linking their thoughts and experiences to their learning (Boud et al., 2005; Duley, 1995) and so do teachers to assess themselves and transform their practices (McAlpine & Weston, 2000).

The pedagogical practices of participants were analyzed from two angles in terms of reflection: the first reflection involves an individual reflection in situ, in teachers' classroom decisions while teaching is taken place. This is called "reflection in action" (Schön, 1992, p. 37). The second angle refers to "reflection on action" (Schön, 1992, p.

36). This reflection occurs when people take time to think about their own actions after they have happened. This reflection is also called by Perrenoud (1998) "a posteriori" and can lead to knowledge.

Furthermore, reflection is not only a self-reflective process, but also can be enriched by others through their feedback (Soisangwarn & Wongwanich, 2014; Lund, 2016). According to abovementioned ways to approach reflection, there are two types of methods that involve it and become relevant to study teaching practices.

## SELF-CONFRONTATION (SIMPLE AND CROSSED)

Self-confrontation is a method that allows people to observe, recall and reflect on their practices to look for adjustments (Ceni Dinardi, 2009; Cicurel, 2016; Pam, 2013). It uses video recordings with the purpose of going in-depth in people's actions. Eachus (1965) attests that using video recordings offer the possibility to self- confront or provide feedback to others. Self-confrontation is also conceived as a method that has benefits in psychological advice to enhance behavioral changes in people (Lyddon, et al., 2006). In the educational strands, it is also used to comprehend teachers' work, their activities, actions, experiences, verbal interactions, and knowledge (Faïta & Saujat, 2010). In language teaching, it is implemented to invite teachers to analyze and be aware of their practices and their interactions with students to comprehend their teaching activities (Muller et al., 2016).

These are two types of self-confrontation: simple and crossed. Simple self-confrontation allows a person at work to reflect on and analyze what he or she does through the observation of his or her videorecording of activities performed. Crossed self-confrontation entails having other people watching the video recordings of someone's practices to enhance a conversation among them and seek problem solving or feedback on

the activities observed. Both self-confrontations are guided by a researcher or counselor (Clot et al., 2000).

In this research study I followed two kinds of self-confrontation (simple and crossed) to foster in-service EFL teachers' reflection on their pedagogical practices based on two of their videorecorded class sessions with the purpose of unveiling what *knowledges* emerged from the reflection on action.

## KNOWLEDGES OF TEACHERS

To understand teachers' knowledge within the research study I conducted, I present some types of knowledge revealed in-service EFL teachers. Teachers' knowledge is nourished by different types of knowledge along teachers' professional life as content knowledge, curriculum knowledge, and experiential knowledge (Tardif et al., 1991) and there are many aspects that determine its development (Révai & Guerreiro, 2017; Liu, 2010). From another perspective, teachers' knowledge embraces the "pedagogical "Knowledge-base" which entails "both theoretical or scientific knowledge (e.g. theories of learning and of teaching-learning processes …) and practical or practice-based knowledge (e.g. situated knowledge)" (Verloop, Van Driel & Meijer, as cited in Guerreiro, 2017, p.103). For Shulman (1986), it implies the knowledge teachers have in relation to what and how they teach. According to this author, both content and teaching are interconnected when dealing with teaching endeavors.

To explain some of the components of teachers' knowledge, Shulman (1986) explains that one of them corresponds to content knowledge that encompasses other types of knowledge within it: ""(a) subject matter content knowledge, (b) pedagogical content knowledge, and (c) curricular knowledge" (p. 9). Based on the author, these types of knowledge are related to the content people master and how they teach this

content within an educational setting. Thence, this knowledge also contains the pedagogical knowledge people should handle to teach in any educational institution under any curriculum. This implies that teachers should know about the content, pedagogical and curriculum knowledge.

Concerning the pedagogical knowledge, Fernández (2014) defines it as "the educational purposes, the methods of teaching and learning (;) that is, knowledge about techniques or methods used in the classroom, the nature of the target audience and strategies for assessing students' knowledge" (p. 83). Additionally, "Pedagogical knowledge is used to facilitate effective teaching practices in ways that aim to make learning more accessible to students" (Hudson et al., 2015, p. 135). For Zambrano (2019), this knowledge results from the consolidation of teachers' actions and experiences, among others, and teachers' reflections regarding teaching along the history and the generation of knowledge. With respect to English teaching, Dadvand and Behzadpoor (2020) propose nine constituents of pedagogical knowledge, which are: "knowledge of subject matter; knowledge of teaching; knowledge of students; knowledge of classroom management; knowledge of educational context; knowledge of democracy, equity and diversity; knowledge of assessment/testing; knowledge of learning; and knowledge of (professional) self" (p. 122). In sum, there are several knowledges involved in the teaching and learning of a subject matter.

However, I also followed Kincheloe's (2004) critical view regarding teachers' knowledge. This author refers to the "empirical", "normative", "critical", "ontological", "experiential", and "reflective-synthetic" knowledges (pp. 53-62). The empirical is oriented to the observation of practices relying on a contextualized perspective involving sociocultural and political strands influencing them; the normative is centered on the relevance of norms and ethics to get rid of inequity within the classroom and educational

settings; the critical one is focused on unmasking relationships in educational contexts and purports the recognition of diversity; the ontological refers to teachers' self-reflection and realities to resist dogmatic and autocratic trends, to recognize themselves as knowledge builders, and then, to act consistently; the experiential emphasizes on the fact that teachers' practices are varied, multifaceted, contextualized, and unexpected; it permeates their actions; finally, the reflective-synthetic embraces the conjugation and reflection on the preceding knowledges.

For Kincheloe (2004), this kind of critical view of knowledge is not about having a brainwashing to exercise a specific practice but rather to keep a reflective practice to propose a conjuncture of the abovementioned kinds of knowledge. In that sense, pedagogical practice contributes to strengthen democratic values such as justice, equity, freedom, and ethics in the classroom and the educational contexts.

## RESEARCH DESIGN

Concerning the importance of experiences to build up pedagogical practices, Van Manen (1990) claims that "our appropriation of the meaning of lived experience is always of something past that can never be grasped in its full richness and depth since lived experience implicates the totality of life" (p. 36). The scholar considers that people's experiences are part of their heritage of living. As the comprehension of teachers' experiences and their meaning are relevant to this study, I relied on Kafle (2011) who explains that "Hermeneutic phenomenology is focused on subjective experience of individuals and groups. It is an attempt to unveil the world as experienced by the subject through their life world stories" (p. 181). Within self-confrontation, participants have the possibility to share their experiences regarding their practices. As self-confrontation awakens past events through the observation of video recordings, teachers confronted their actions and experiences with the purpose of

reflecting on them. The participants of this study recorded two class sessions to develop their simple and crossed self-confrontations not only to recall their own actions, but also to evince their classroom realities.

As people's life experiences and realities are researched through the qualitative approach, this study was conducted under its premises. To this respect, Creswell (2007) corroborates that researchers within this approach are faced to assortment when dealing with participants and scenarios showing the relevance of human dimensions to read and interpret their unique actions and contexts. Thence, the selection of this approach permitted to avoid generalizations as participants have their own experiences, so that the methodology chosen was an instrumental case study whose intention was not to compare or generalize participants' analysis but rather to understand a phenomenon (Crawford, 2016; Durán, 2012; Neiman & Quaranta, 2006; Stake, 1999), as teachers' knowledges through their pedagogical practices.

In the current research study, I had four participants, EFL teachers with different backgrounds who worked with different courses. As mentioned before, this article refers to data only of four participants (M1). This person is an in-service EFL teacher working in a public school in Bogotá who graduated from a master's program in education and has between 21-30 years of experience. To choose the participants who intervened in this study, I followed the convenience sampling technique. In this regard, Creswell (2007) affirms that "Researchers can sample at the site level, at the event or process level, and at the participant level" (p. 126). It is worth mentioning that it was a complex process to find in-service EFL teachers available and willing to participate in a research study of this nature.

To gather data, I used eight simple and eight crossed self-confrontation interviews with their

corresponding video recordings transcriptions, one semi-structured interview at the end of the self-confrontation process, one focus group interview, and field notes. The self-confrontations were recorded in three specific moments. The first corresponded to the moment when the simple self-confrontations were conducted. Each participant had two video recordings of two of their class sessions. Thus, eight simple self-confrontations were conducted. The second moment concerned the first crossed self-confrontations in pairs. There were five in total. Finally, participants could share their videos in triads during the third moment. There were three in total.

To analyze data, first, I followed the thematic approach proposed by Braun and Clarke (2006): "a method for identifying, analysing, and reporting patterns (themes) within data. It minimally organises and describes your data set in (rich) detail" (p. 6). According to the authors, "Through its theoretical freedom, thematic analysis provides a flexible and useful research tool, which can potentially provide a rich and detailed, yet complex account of data" (p. 5). In addition, researchers need to follow some phases to use it: (1) "familiarizing yourself with your data"; "transcription of verbal data"; (2) "generating initial codes"; (3) "searching for themes"; (4) "reviewing themes"; (5) "defining and naming themes"; and (6) "producing the report" (pp. 16-23).

In this study, I transcribed each one of the instruments to be familiarized in-depth with data. Then, I used color coding to identify patterns and themes. After that, I systematized them in a matrix to triangulate data in which I classified the information found to interpret and refine the themes as part of a second moment of analysis to comprehend the in-service EFL teaching practices through the lens of the hermeneutic phenomenology proposed by van Manen (1990, 1994). Hermeneutic phenomenology

considers people's meanings and experiences major aspects fundamental to interpret them by using the thematic analysis. Currently, I am in the process of revising the themes to label them accordingly.

## FINDINGS IN PARTICIPANT M1

As previously mentioned, this article only presents data of one participant. The first knowledge evinced was the empirical one. To this respect, Kincheloe (2004) remarks that

> Critical complex empiricism understands that knowledge about humans and their social practices is fragmented, diverse, and always constructed by human beings coming from different contexts. Such a form of knowledge does not lend itself to propositional statements — i.e., final truths. (p. 53)

In the analysis, some traits of this participant came out through data reduction and preliminary themes identification such as when she described her students and institutional context.

The first example shows that participant M1 knows her students and their contexts. Participant M1 was assigned a course called 'aula de inmersión' (immersion classroom). It is key to mention that the Colombian government sought for programs such as *basic processes* and *immersion classroom*s to support students under conditions such as overaged, dropouts, and displacement, among others.

This course grouped students with different characteristics: some were overaged, others were displaced due to violence they underwent in their contexts. They had not been able to finish their primary studies. The following excerpt describes this situation.

M1: That is an odd group consisted of children belonging to basic processes for different circumstances like overage, school dropping out

due to violent assaults, or forced displacement from rural areas to big cities. Overaged children who have not finished primary school need to go back to school and start studying again._This child is in the process of learning and is more advanced. But there are children who are just beginning the learning process of reading (…). What counts is their progress along the year. This is a complex group because of its many uncommon conditions in which they have come. They also have several learning problems. Thus, the use of the strategies has been difficult to me, in contrast with other groups I have worked with. They sometimes associate class games with class mess. In some cases, fun learning to memorize is also difficult to them. Besides, they get distracted. Then, I must switch the class activity. I will tell you about this experience because this is the first time that I have this group. Teacher M1´s first simple self-confrontation, video 1, lines 5-22. (Translation)

M1 affirmed that these students had already begun their process of literacy in their mother tongue. According to their learning progress, they could be promoted to a higher course. Regarding her classroom context, she emphasized that it was a hard course to manage because this was the first time, she was teaching students with this type of difficulties.

Although participant M1 had not experienced teaching groups with these complex life situations and learning problems, she realized that it was hard for her to develop the same learning strategies she was used to. The uncertainty she faced was a lighter to renew her practice and to look for appropriate learning strategies to suit her students' learning. Being confronted with reality leads teachers to reflect in action and to find quick changes to adapt to the unpredictable situation. Kincheloe (2004) highlights that the manner this knowledge "is understood will always involve the interaction between our general conceptions of it and its relationship with ever-changing contexts" (p. 53). Understanding

students' context might be a possibility to rethink own practices. This passage of the field notes evinced how M1 described students' context, which was totally new for her as teacher.

She told me that the group in the video had special features because they were going through basic processes and explained that they were overaged or dropped out-of-school children due to various situations such as forced displacement or displacement due to violence or have not finished primary school. The purpose of basic processes is to prepare children for schooling again and attend the corresponding courses after leveling. I want to point out that M1 is teaching her classes in primary school; therefore, elementary school education is included in the research because the other teachers are in secondary and middle school education. The course that M1 presented in its first video is a heterogeneous group with learning problems.

Some are learning reading and it is a difficult group according to M1. As observed, M1 considers that her students are complex because they do not come from the regular process she has followed with her current students. However, she states that the activities she has carried out have been helpful for her students. Field notes M1 Self-confrontation – 1- L13-27 (Translation)

Field notes revealed that participant M1 had a complex context. However, she reflected on the students' learning and developed activities to guide them. Based on the description of M1's context and her decision making, I inferred that the "reflective-synthetic knowledge" (Kincheloe, 2004, p. 62) arose since she could overcome the circumstance of the context and changed her teaching actions to let students learn.

In this regard, Kincheloe (2004) highlights that teacher educators display this kind of knowledge and other sociocultural knowledges which might allow them to seek for ways to learn from

· 2 3 3 ·

teachers' realities. Context shaped M1 practice. Based on Kincheloe's words, participant M1 not only understood her context, but also reflected on activities that could reach students' learning.

In the following example from the semi-structured interview, I asked M1 about the context of students' learning. She mentioned her students' overage due to their displacement conditions and their parents' illiteracy. These conditions led M1 to make decisions consisting of avoiding assigning homework. Due to students' context and limitations, she faced difficulties teaching them.

Researcher (I): How did you see that the context influenced the learning of your students since you mention you are always there or you have presented the context in the classroom, family, and then the country, etc.? M1: Well, in this context there are students, especially overaged children are in this group. What do you mean? That there was a reason why parents did not send him to school. Maybe, they moved from town, or were displaced because of the violence in Colombia. This is the case of illiterate parents who do not know how to read or write. All that has an impact. That is why I did not assign homework. I guess the regular classroom teacher rarely assigns homework because most parents and guardians cannot help them. Then, there are children affected by economic and family conditions who cannot go beyond. Then, there are many limitations. Then, within their context, children face complex situations in which parents do not cooperate because they do not have the resources to do it. Then, one must take that into account. Interview M1-L355-366 (Translation)

The previous examples corroborated that the context implied limitations. From my perspective, she changed her classroom actions due to the obstacles she faced when trying to teach her students. Thus, she was aware of students' reality and considered their home circumstances

where parents or guardians were illiterate and could not help students; hence, she decided not to give them assignments. In this sense, she made a reflection on action due to her context and the need to look for different strategies to teach them. Her decision arose from the process of self-confrontation with the researcher which helped her evoke the reason behind her actions.

According to Niño (2014), "In terms of education for IDPs [Internal Displaced Persons], the national government and individual Colombian districts have created programs that determine the level of students who are over the average student age or have been outside the education system" (p. 33). As M1 had not worked with students under these conditions, she experienced a new stage in her pedagogical practice that allowed her to reflect on them and generated a change in her way of teaching students.

Regarding experiential and reflective-synthetic knowledges, Kincheloe (2004) highlights that the former entails that the teaching practice is full of unpredictability since it is the result of human beings' interaction who are unique and act out in a particular context. Thus, practice cannot be replicated and makes teachers reflect to rebuild and enrich it. In that sense, teachers could assume openness to the unpredictability to promote transformation in their classrooms. The latter implies fostering a democratic ground within their classroom through teachers' actions. Likewise, being aware of the unpredictability of practice, teachers can avoid standardized practices.

In addition, M1 showed her "reflection in action" and "reflection on action" to explain her activities. Schön (1992) underlines that teachers' reflection on their past actions might change them in the future. M1's self-confrontations showed the relevance of decision making through the reflection on her past actions and on what she could have done by means of her self-questioning when being confronted to her video recordings.

· 2 3 4 ·

Recalling through the videos permitted her to relive what she had experienced and fostered her reflection. Leblanc et al. (2013) consider that video recordings favor the gathering of enriching and worthy empirical information of teachers' actions and activities.

M1 manifested that she made a quick decision in class to accomplish the goal set beforehand. When she was developing a total physical response activity for students to identify house chores and mime what the teacher was telling them, she realized that her students did not understand the activity. Then, she made a quick decision to change it. The next example displayed her reflection in action.

All right, what happened here? I made that decision. It was not my class plan. The class agenda included activities related to specific places of the house (house chores). When I realized that the strategy did not function, I made a quick decision and asked everyone to find the word "house" and make movements related to the house chores. That was a sudden decision. I must confess, that I improvised it in that moment the activity, so that I did not spoil the whole diagram and avoid feeling defeated. Of course, I did not achieve anything and decided to quit; when I cannot attain something at that time, I always make a quick decision to reach the goal. Then, I confess that it was an unexpected decision I had not planned. Simple self-confrontation M1 – 2- L 44-55 (Translation).

When we are doing an activity, we can make decisions and adjust what we are doing without thinking in-depth about our new decision (Schön, 1992). Apparently, this type of reflection is unanticipated. It might be done when we face any circumstance in which we need to proceed immediately. This corresponds to a reflection in action (Schön, 1992). M1 made a decision that was not contemplated, and she validated that she frequently made quick decisions to do something in concrete. This

situation was evinced after watching her video recorded class activity through her simple self-confrontation, which allowed her to reflect on her decision making. Schön (1992) stresses that in unexpected circumstances our knowledge in action might help us to rethink over the actions done to reflect on action.

In the samples below, M1 was describing her class activity to another participant (M3) and she perceived that her students did not remember a previous activity. Thus, she changed the activity she had planned and improvised a review as an unprepared one. In the field notes shown below, M1 considers that her students knew the vocabulary practiced. However, she realized they did not. As a result, she created a new activity emerged from her reflection in action. This reflection on action allowed to evince her reflection in action, thanks to the self-confrontations.

M1: I had started taking up the parts of the house and started connecting them with house chores immediately. I only saw the second part. Once I noticed that they did not remember much. I said, "let's have a review right now" and I sent them to take out the activity that they had forgotten. That was the assessment from the previous class. Crossed self-confrontation M1 & M3- 2- L 379-383 (Translation)

M1: I started a review based on the workshop developed in the previous class to verify the answers. Not everyone had grasped the answers from the previous class. I invented that activity right there. I had a short a review adjusted to the circumstances (…). Crossed self-confrontation M1 & M3- 2- L 396-399 (Translation)

M1 assumed that the students already knew the vocabulary that they had worked on and found that they were lost. Therefore, they changed their mind due to their reflection on the action. She had to do a check in (I do not know what she meant exactly). I guessed it was something

to do through a survey to see what they knew. Apparently, due to the challenges faced in her class, the teacher followed a different activity from the one she had been planned. Field notes, M1 & M3 cross self-confrontation- 1- L 18-23 (Translation)

The previous samples show M1's decision making process as a result of the specific circumstances she was facing. This was a consequence of her reflection in action. In this sense, Schön (1992) claims that an action that is ongoing can be combined with another one, which integrates reflection in action concurrently. In relation to the importance of reflecting on what we should have done, the following excerpt from her second video recording emphasizes on the relevance of watching the video recordings of our pedagogical practices to identify flaws and make new decisions. Self-confrontation concedes M1 the possibility to go back in the past and rethink what she had done to find new ways to approach the activity and attain students' comprehension easier next time.

M1: This is the last class. Then, they are tired; me too (…). while watching the video again, I can conclude that I should have done this before starting the activity; for that reason, I find this process interesting if you manage to recall what you learnt. If you do not do the video, certain parts of the class, if they are returned: ah, I was supposed to do such, such a thing. As a teacher, you do make that reflection at the end of class. I do not take notes because no; why I am going to tell you lies, but I do it in my mind, but more specifically, it is doing this kind of exercises, for example, this I would have done it before starting the activity of the *diogram*, by the House. Simple self-confrontation M1 - 2- L 54-66

Going back to our past practice helps to renew practices. Hofer (2017) confirms that when something we had planned does not function, we can take advantage of reflection to find out what happened. The scholar suggests that it

is fundamental to keep records of what we do. In that way, we can recall what we have done and reflect on our actions. In her words, this corresponds to "reflective practice" (p. 299). In addition, teachers require to assess their own practice and knowledge by following an informed decision making. This exercise will allow teachers to generate transformations in their practices.

Regarding the benefit of self-confrontation, in the focus group interview, M1 expressed that she had the opportunity to improve her planning and to be more aware of the relevance of being systematic in her planning process. She did not carry out any written format for her lessons, but she used to plan them in her mind. Due to the self-confrontation method, she started keeping a notebook record, where she organized her lessons in a practical way to follow her students' progress more closely. In that way, she noticed aspects she had disregarded in her previous classes. The following excerpt reveals a preliminary feature of M1's pedagogical content knowledge or didactic knowledge. She applies changes to her planned sequence.

M1: Well, during this year, I did the self-confrontations, (…) I kept thinking that I was very disorganized in terms of (...) planning. In other words, I did not follow a systematic class plan since I improvised the activities when I was about to start the class, OK? (…) I was aware of my planning of the activities that I carried out, of writing because I almost did not write; I had everything in my mind, or I remembered "I'm going to do this". Thus, I planned everything in my mind without writing the class procedure. This year, I made a resolution to be more dedicated and aware of what I am doing, what I am going to do and plan during the week. I will make changes to prepare my classes and keep a written record of my lesson plans centered on students' needs and have a more practical teaching process to recognize the students' daily progress, which is

sometimes disregarded. Focus group - M1 - L 26-40

Díaz Barriga (n.d.) considers the didactic planning as several proposed activities within a didactic sequence. Planning gives account of intertwined activities that guide teachers to care of teaching and learning within a classroom. Thus, the self-confrontations helped M1 recognize the relevance of having her planning systematized to keep a close look on her students' learning process.

Notwithstanding, it is unattainable to be precise about the entire teacher knowledge one person can display through his or her pedagogical practice. However, some of them can be elicited from each participant to discover the different shades these practices might have through reflection on action.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Self-confrontation as a method to help teachers reflect on their actions facilitated participant M1 to be more conscious of what she does in her classes in relation to her students, their learning process, their context, and realities. M1 had the opportunity to recall her difficulties and how she could face them when re-observing her two video recordings in the simple self-confrontations. Likewise, she could go deeper into her decision making in relation to her practice when evoking students' English level, context, and life difficulties.

Similarly, she was aware of the unpredictability of practices when she faced a heterogeneous group of students and had to learn from them to adapt her teaching practices to students' needs. This method allowed her to set aside the planning process proposed by the school and look for contextualized and relevant activities. Moreover, both types of self-confrontation guided M1 to recall past activities, to bring out her experiences, to share her knowledge with others, to be conscious of her classroom decision

making, and to look for possible solutions to face her own difficulties and challenges.

As the purpose of self-confrontations was to enhance reflection on action, M1 was able to see her practice from a different perspective. She described her reflection in action when recalling and explaining her actions as a path to rethink what she did in her classes and help her students learn in a better way. Reflection on action was a drive to evince the presence of the reflection in action when she described her decision making.

The emergence of some types of knowledge were seen in a preliminary way: empirical, experiential, and reflective knowledges. They were revealed when M1 understood the difficulties her students faced due to their realities: displacement and lack of parents' support. Thus, M1 was aware of the importance of knowing students' context and the consequences of actions she undertook to face her classroom problems. As a result, she decided not to assign any homework. Her practice was also transformed by unexpected situations due to her students' life circumstances and context.

In sum, self-confrontations and reflection in/on action helped M1 to be aware of her pedagogical practices by recognizing the relevance of understanding students' needs and context to make reflective decisions in her classroom. Regarding her teacher knowledge, I realized that M1's pedagogical practices were centered on thorough observations of her own classroom experiences: the fact of being able to observe her classroom practices allowed her to solve unexpected situations. Likewise, being able to operate changes in her classroom practices and observe them afterwards permitted her to reflect in-depth on the improvement on her approach to students. This achievement resulted from the simple and crossed self-confrontations processes, which nurtured her viewpoint of her practices. I hope this study serves as a gateway to generate changes in in-service EFL teaching

practices in Colombia and to foster reflection upon classroom actions regarding knowledge and experience to involve teachers as critical practitioners and social actors.

## BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES

Álvarez, J. A. (2009). An exploration of Colombian EFL teachers' knowledge base through teachers' reflection. *Linguagem & Ensino, Pelotas*, *12*(1), 73-108. https://doi.org/10.15210/rle.v12i1.15700

Bonilla, C. A., & Tejada, I. (2016). Unanswered questions in Colombia's language education policy. *PROFILE Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, *18*(1), 185-201. http://dx.doi.org/10.15446/profile.v18n1.51996

Boud, D., Keogh, R., & Walker, D. (2005) (eds.). What is reflection in learning? In D. Boud, R. Keogh, & D. Walker. *Reflection: Turning experience into learning* (pp. 7-17). RoutledgeFalmer Taylor & Francis Group. https://craftingjustice.files.wordpress.com/2017/04/david-boud-rosemary-keogh-david-walker-reflection_-turning-experience-into-learning-routledge-1985-pp-1-165.pdf

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 1-41. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/235356393

Cárdenas, M. L. (2006, September 14). Bilingual Colombia: Are we ready for it? What is needed? Proceedings of the 19th Annual English Australia Education Conference. https://www.academia.edu/17543725/Bilingual_Colombia_Are_we_ready_for_it_What_is_needed

Cárdenas, M., & Boada, M.M. (2012). El movimiento pedagógico 1982-1998. In O. L. Zuluaga, J.O. Castro, C.E. Noguera, J.A. Echeverri, D.B. Osorio, …J.H. Pérez. *Historia de la educación en Bogotá Tomo II* (2nd. Ed.) (pp. 195-225). Serie Investigación IDEP.

Cardona, M del S. (2005). El movimiento pedagógico: Una lucha social, política y cultural del magisterio colombiano 1982-2002 (Tesis de Maestría). Universidad de Antioquia, Medellín, Colombia. http://bibliotecadigital.udea.edu.co/bitstream/10495/7517/1/CardonaMorelia_2005_MovimientoPedagogicoLuchaSocial.pdf

Ceni Denardi, D. A. (2009). Flying together towards EFL teacher development as language learners and professionals through genre writing. (Ph.D thesis). Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina Pós-graduação em Letras – Inglês. Florianópolis, Brasil.

Cicurel, F. (2016). Reconfigurer l'action enseignante pour la (re) découvrir : traces du répertoire didactique évolutif. *Revue Phronesis, 5*(3-4), 16–27.

https://doi.org/10.7202/1039083ar

Clot, Y., Faïta, D., Fernandez, G., & Scheller, L. (2000). Entretiens en autoconfrontation croisée : une méthode en clinique de l'activité. *Perspectives interdisciplinaires sur le travail et la santé* [En ligne], *2*(1), 1-9. http://pistes.revues.org/3833

Council of Europe (2001). Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment. https://rm.coe.int/1680459f97

Crawford, K.M. (2016). Developing the whole teacher: A phenomenological case study of student teachers' emotions in one teacher education program (Doctoral

dissertation). http://digitalcommons.georgiasouthern.edu/curr_etd/

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry & research design choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Sage Publications Inc.

Dadvand, B., & Behzadpoor, F. (2020). Pedagogical Knowledge in English Language Teaching: A Lifelong-Learning, Complex-System Perspective. *London Review of Education*, *18*(1), 107–125. https://doi.org/10.18546/LRE.18.1.08

Dewey, J. (2004). *Democracy and education*. Aakar Books.

Díaz Barriga, Á. (n.d.). Guía para la elaboración de una secuencia didáctica. Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México Comunidad de Conocimiento UNAM, 1-15. http://envia3.xoc.uam.mx/envia-2-7/beta/uploads/recursos/xYYzPtXmGJ7hZ9Ze_Guia_secuencias_didacticas_Angel_Diaz.pdf

Duley, J. S. (1995). A glipse of a new experiential learning theory paradigm.

*University of Nebraska Omaha Service Learning General,* 1-14. https://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1053&context=slceslgen

Durán, M.M. (2012). El estudio de caso en la investigación cualitativa. *Revista Nacional de Administración*, *3*(1), 121-134. https://doi.org/10.22458/rna.v3i1.477

Eachus, H. T. (1965). Self-confrontation for complex skill training review and analysis. Aerospace medical research laboratories. Aerospace medical research laboratories aerospace medical

division air force systems command Wright-Patterson force base, Ohio air. Clearinghouse for Federal Scientific and Technical -Information. https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/624062.pdf

Faïta, D., & Saujat, F. (2010). Développer l'activité des enseignants pour comprendre et transformer leur travail : Un cadre théorique et méthodologique (pp. 41-71). In F. Yvon, & F. Saussez (Eds.). Les Presses de L'Université Laval.

Fandiño, Y. (2013). Knowledge base and EFL teacher education programs: A Colombian perspective. *Íkala, Revista de Lenguaje y Cultura*, *18*(1), 83–95.

Fernández, C. (2014). Knowledge base for teaching and pedagogical content knowledge (PCK): Some useful models and implications for teachers' training. *PROBLEMS OF EDUCATION IN THE 21$^{st}$ CENTURY*, 60, 79-100.

Gómez, M. M. (2017). Review and analysis of the Colombian Foreign Language Bilingualism policies and plans. *HOW Journal*, *24*(1), 139–156.

Gómez, J. C. (2020). Development of EFL teachers' pedagogical content knowledge through action research in a master's program. *PROBLEMS OF EDUCATION IN THE 21stCENTURY*, *78*(4), 533-552. https://doi.org/10.33225/pec/20.78.533

González, L.I., & Tibaduiza, H. D. (2015). El movimiento pedagógico en Colombia y la subjetividad del maestro a 20 años de la ley general de educación: Grupo de historia de la práctica pedagógica. (Tesis de maestría). Universidad Javeriana de Colombia. https://repository.javeriana.edu.co/bitstream/handle/10554/18669/GonzalezAyalaLibiaIsabel2015.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

Guerreiro, S. (2017). Teachers' pedagogical knowledge: What it is and how it functions (pp. 99-115). In S. Guerriero (ed.), *Pedagogical Knowledge and the Changing Nature of the Teaching Profession*, OECD Publishing, Paris. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264270695-en

Hofer, B. K. (2017). Shaping the epistemology of teacher practice through reflection and reflexivity. *Educational Psychologist*, *52*(4), 299–306. https://basesbiblioteca.uexternado.edu.co:2199/10.1080/00461520.2017.1355247

Hudson, P., English, L., Dawes, L., King, D., & Baker, S. (2015). Exploring Links between Pedagogical Knowledge Practices and Student Outcomes in STEM Education for Primary Schools. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, *40*(6), 134-151. http://ro.ecu.edu.au/ajte/vol40/iss6/8

Kafle, N. P. (2011). Hermeneutic phenomenological research method simplified. *Bodhi: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 5, 181-200.

Kincheloe, J. L. (2004). The Knowledges of teacher education: Developing a critical complex epistemology. *Teacher Education Quarterly, Winter 2004*, 49-66.

Korthagen, F.A.J., & Vasalos, A, (2005). Levels in reflection: Core reflection

as a means to enhance professional growth. *Teachers and Teaching*, *11*(1), 47-71, DOI: 10.1080/1354060042000337093

Leblanc, S., Ria, L., & Veyrunes, Ph. (2013). Vidéo et analyse in situ des situations d'enseignement et de formation dans le programme du cours d'action. L. Veillard A. Tiberghien. *Instrumentation de la recherche en Education. Le cas du développement d'une base de vidéos de situation d'enseignement et d'apprentissage ViSA.*, Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, pp.63-94. <http://books.openedition.org/editionsmsh/1930>. <hal-00804095>

HAL Id: hal-00804095

https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/hal-00804095

Liu, S. (2010). Teachers' knowledge: Review from comparative perspective. *New Horizons in Education*, *58*(1), 148-158.

Lund, L. (2016). How teachers reflect on their pedagogy: Learning from teachers' pedagogical vocabulary. *Journal of the International Society for Teacher Education*, *20*(2), 22–35.

Lyddon, W. J., Yowell, D. R., & Hermans, H. J. M. (2006). The self-confrontation method: Theory, research, and practical utility. *Counselling Psychology Quarterly*, *19*(1), 27–43.

Macías, D. F. (2013). An Exploration of EFL Teachers' Awareness of the Sources of Pedagogical Knowledge in a Teacher Education Program. *Profile: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development, 15*(2), 99-114.

Martínez, M. (2019). Olga Lucía Zuluaga Garcés: 40 años de historizar y conceptualizar la Pedagogía en Colombia. Entrevista, *Pedagogía y Saberes*, 51, 145-155.

McAlpine, L., & Weston, C. (2000). Reflection: Issues related to improving professors' teaching and students' learning. *Instructional Science*, *28*(5/6),

. 2 4 0 .

363-385. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23371455

Ministerio de Educación Nacional Colombia Aprende La red del conocimiento (2016). Programa Nacional de Bilingüismo Serie de textos. https://aprende.colombiaaprende.edu.co/colombiabilingue/94009

Ministerio de Educación Nacional (2020). 192.800 estudiantes de los grados 9°, 10° y 11° recibirán la edición "fast track 2016" de los libros "English, Please!". https://www.mineducacion.gov.co/1759/w3-article-356134.html?_noredirect=1

Muller, C., David, C., & Crozier, E. (2016). «Des corpus vidéo pour la formation des enseignants de langue », *Recherches en didactique des langues et des cultures* [En ligne], 1-19. http://journals.openedition.org/rdlc/484

Neiman, G., & Quaranta, G. (2006). Los estudios de caso en la investigación sociológica (pp.213-234). En I. Vasilachis de Gialdino. (Coord.) (2006). *Estrategias de investigación cualitativa*. Gedisa Editorial.

Niño, L. (2014). The effects of differentiated instruction on the literacy process of learners with interrupted schooling. *Gist Education and Learning Research Journal*, 9, 31-49.

Núñez, A., Ramos, B., & Téllez, M. F. (2006). Reflexión en el contexto educativo: hacia la toma de decisiones en el aula. *@puntes Cont@bles*, 11, 111-115.

Núñez-Pardo, A. (2020a). Inquiring into the coloniality of knowledge, power and being in EFL textbooks. *HOW Journal*, *27*(2), 113-133.

Núñez-Pardo, A. (2020b). Decolonizar el libro de texto de inglés en el contexto colombiano: Una apuesta desde la interculturalidad crítica (Doctoral dissertation). Universidad Pedagógica y Tecnológica de Colombia.

Pam, N.M.S. (2013), "SELF-CONFRONTATION," in PsychologyDictionary.org, April 13, 2013. https://psychologydictionary.org/self-confrontation/

Peñuela, D. M., & Rodríguez, V. M. (2006). Movimiento pedagógico: otras formas de resistencia educativa. *FOLIOS -Segunda época*, *23*, 3-14.

Perrenoud, Ph. (1998). De la réflexion dans le feu de l'action

à une pratique réflexive. Faculté de psychologie et des sciences de l'éducation Université de Genève. Développer la pratique réflexive dans le métier d'enseignant. Professionnalisation et raison pédagogique, Paris, ESF. https://www.unige.ch/fapse/SSE/teachers/perrenoud/php_main/php_1998/1998_31.html

Révai, N., & Guerreiro, S. (2017). Knowledge dynamics in the teaching profession (pp. 37-68). In S. Guerriero (ed.), *Pedagogical Knowledge and the Changing Nature of the Teaching Profession*, OECD Publishing, Paris. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264270695-en

Ríos, R. (2018). La práctica pedagógica como herramienta para historiar la pedagogía en Colombia. *Pedagogía y Saberes*, 49, 27-40.

Sánchez-Jabba, A. (2013). *Bilingüismo en Colombia*. *Documentos de trabajo sobre economía regional*, 191, Banco de la República. http://www.banrep.gov.co/

docum/Lectura_finanzas/pdf/dtser_191.pdf

Sánchez Solarte, A. C., & Obando Guerrero, G. V. (2008). Is Colombia Ready for "Bilingualism"? / ¿Colombia está lista para el "bilingüismo"? *PROFILE: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, *9*, 181–196.

Schön, D. (1992). *La formación de profesionales reflexivos Hacia un nuevo diseño de la enseñanza y el aprendizaje en las profesiones*. Ediciones Paidós.

Shulman, F. S. (1986). Those who understand: Knowledge growth in teaching. *Educational Researcher*, *15*(2), 4-14. http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0013-189X%28198602%2915%3A2%3C4%3ATWUKGI%3E2.0.CO%3B2-X

Soisangwarn, A., & Wongwan, S. (2014). Promoting the reflective teacher through peer coaching to improve teaching skills. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences 116*, 2504 – 2511. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.01.601

Stake, R. E. (1999). *Investigación con estudio de casos* (2nd ed.). Ediciones Morata.

Tamayo, A. (2006). El movimiento pedagógico en Colombia (Un encuentro de los maestros con la pedagogía.). *Revista HISTEDBR On-line, Campinas, 24,* 102 –113. http://www.histedbr.fe.unicamp.br/revista/edicoes/24/art09_24.pdf

Tardif, M., Lessard, C., & Lahaye, L. (1991). Les enseignants des ordres d'enseignement primaire et secondaire face aux savoirs: Esquisse d'une problématique du savoir enseignant. *Sociologie et Sociétés*, *23*(1),55-69. https://doi.org/10.7202/001785ar

Van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience. Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. State University of New York Press.

Van Manen, M. (1994). Pedagogy, virtue, and narrative identity in teaching.

*Curriculum Inquiry*, *24*(2), 135-170. doi:10.2307/1180112

Zambrano, A. (2019). Naturaleza y diferenciación del saber pedagógico y didáctico. *Pedagogía y Saberes*, 50, 75-84.